Baseball Commissioner Manfred Declines to Reopen Buck Weaver Case

By Dr. David Fletcher
President, Chicago Baseball Museum
Posted Wednesday, July 29, 2015

This week I received a detailed three-page letter from Commissioner Manfred forever closing the door on Buck Weaver (and probably Pete Rose.) There is no dispute that Buck attended two meetings where the throwing of the World Series was discussed. He rejected being part of the scheme, as evidenced by his performance in 1919 World Series and the fact that no one has ever said he took any money as part of the scheme, unlike Jackson. He had no one to tell since all the powers that be (Comiskey, Manager Gleason, Ban Johnson, etc.) all knew about the plot yet failed to stop the 1919 World Series.

Hall-of-Famer Sox catcher Ray Schalk always referred to the seven men out making a point that Weaver was not involved. Charles Comiskey did the same until his death in 1931.

I do appreciate that Commissioner Manfred's letter was a thoughtful letter that provided a longer explanation than past letters. However, it ignores the Holtzman investigation ordered by Commissioner Selig that recommended exoneration of Weaver.

Two major points emerge:

1. Compare Buck to the present Pete Rose situation. How could Manfred even consider reinstatement for Rose based on the tone of this letter? At least Manfred met with Rose briefly at the All-Star game. He should fly to Missouri and at least tell Pat Anderson in person his decision. The
past four Commissioners have avoided a personal meeting with the last living link to the Black Sox and Judge Landis.

2. Compare Buck’s situation to the threat that performance-enhancing steroids had on the game of baseball, but no player came forward until Jose Canseco ratted on his fellow players who cheated.

There is the precedent of Ray Fisher who was banned by Judge Landis in 1921 but reinstated by Commissioner Kuhn in 1980 after lobbying by ex-President Ford, who was helping his former freshman football coach at the University of Michigan.

Since Bart Giamatti was Commissioner in the ‘80s, a lot of new material has come forward that allows one to recreate the events and correct the historical record, similar to military with its Correction of Military Records-Army Review Boards Agency (ARBA.)

If baseball actually held a real hearing on Weaver/Jackson where evidence could be presented in front on a panel of arbitrators who could actually decide their fate, it would make for fascinating TV and reinforce baseball’s role that relishes its rich history. It would draw a lot of viewers and provide the due process that has been lacking ever since Landis shut the door on 8 men in August 1921.

Read the letter… (PDF format)